Interagency Security Classification Appeals Panel

MEMBERS

DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE
Garry P. Reid
DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
David Laufman
DEPARTMENT OF STATE
Amb. Larry L. Palmer
OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF
NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE
Jennifer L. Hudson
NATIONAL ARCHIVES AND
RECORDS ADMINISTRATION
Sheryl J. Shenberger
NATIONAL SECURITY
COUNCIL.
John P. Fitzpatrick, Chair

c/o Information Security Oversight Office 700 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Room 100 Washington, D.C. 20408 Telephone: (202) 357-5250 Fax: (202) 357-5907

E-mail: iscap@nara.gov

EXECUTIVE SECRETARY

Mark A. Bradley Director INFORMATION SECURITY OVERSIGHT OFFICE

December 30, 2016

Reference: ISCAP No. 2014-089 DOJ MDRA 2014-01548 FBI 2013-03597

Thomas R. Julin Gunster Yoakley & Stewart P.A. 600 Brickell Avenue, Ste. 3500 Miami, FL 33131

Dear Mr. Julin:

With the approval in July 2016 by the Executive branch of the declassification of the information in your ISCAP appeal and the release of that information by Congress, I am administratively closing your appeal. Enclosed is an Executive branch release version of the document under appeal that includes the applicable classification categories or valid statutory withholding categories for each redacted portion.

If you have any questions regarding your appeal, please contact William Carpenter at (202) 357-5466 and reference ISCAP No. 2014-089.

Sincerely,

MARK A. BRADLEY

Mark A. Bralley

Executive Secretary

Enclosure

RELEASED UNDER AUTHORITY OF THE INTERAGENCY SECURITY CLASSIFICATION APPEALS PANEL, E.O. 13526, SECTION 5.3(b)(3)

ISCAP APPEAL NO. 2014-089, document no. 1 DECLASSIFICATION DATE: December 20, 2016

DAC-004 11-03

Congress of the United States

January 29, 2003

The Honorable George J. Tenet Director of Central Intelligence Washington, DC 20505

Dear Director Tenet:

As you know, the final report of the Joint Inquiry into the events of September 11 has been submitted to the Intelligence Community for declassification review. We look forward to early release of the public report so that efforts at reforms can be accelerated.

Having been privileged to lead this bipartisan, bicameral investigation tast year, we are committed to working in the current Congress to help secure implementation of its recommendations. In furtherance of that goal, we are writing to the President and heads of departments and agencies about portions of the Joint Inquiry's recommendations that may be of particular concern to them.

Our first recommendation calls for establishment of a Director of National intelligence, or DNI, who in addition to being the President's principal intelligence adviser "shall have the full range of management, budgetary and personnel responsibilities needed to make the U.S. Intelligence Community operate as a coherent whole." To help promote both strong leadership of the entire Intelligence Community leadership and an effective CIA, the Joint Inquiry also recommended that Congress provide that the DNI not simultaneously serve as director of the CIA or any other agency. In considering this recommendation, the Congress will certainly, we believe, benefit from learning of your views about the strengthening of the role of head of the Intelligence Community.

A number of the recommendations that follow address proposed tasks of the Director of National Intelligence, but as that reform will require study and deliberation, for the Immediate future those further recommendations are directed to the Director of Central Intelligence as the present statutory head of the Intelligence Community.

The Joint Inquiry found that prior to September 11 neither the U.S. Government as a whole nor the Intelligence Community had a comprehensive counterterrorist strategy. One of our recommendations calls on the National Security Council, in conjunction with key agency and department heads, to prepare such a strategy for the President's approval. The recommendation states that the strategy should be

The Honorable George J. Tenet January 29, 2003 Page 2

"government wide," apply both "home and abroad," and include "the growing terrorism threat posed by the proliferation of weapons of mass destruction and associated technologies." The recommendation asks that this strategy identify and fully engage the intelligence as well as foreign policy, economic, military and law enforcement elements that are "critical to a comprehensive blueprint for success in the war against terrorism." The Director of Central Intelligence's full participation in this overall process will be essential, as will the DGI's development of the Intelligence Community component of the full strategy. The Joint Inquiry recommended that the Intelligence Community's component of the overall strategy include a number of important items, among them development of human sources to penetrate terrorist organizations and networks.

To provide to the Congress and Executive Branch policymakers intelligence estimates on terrorism, the Joint Inquiry has recommended establishment on the National Intelligence Council of the position of National Intelligence Officer for Terrorism. The recommendation suggests that the person holding this position also assist the Intelligence Community in developing a program for strategic analysis.

Another recommendation addresses the need for Congress and the Administration to ensure development within the Department of Homeland Security of an effective all-source terrorism information fusion center, as mandated by the Homeland Security Act of 2002. The success of that fusion center will depend, as the recommendation states, on the center's "full and timely access to all counterterrorism-related Intelligence Information, including 'raw' supporting data as needed." Your action to ensure full cooperation between the entire Intelligence Community (including, of course, the CIA) and the Department of Homeland Security will be fundamental to the success of this vital reform. We applied the President's announcement of the establishment of a new Terrorist Threat Integration Center, which we understand will be located under the Director of Central Intelligence. The important challenge, we believe, is to assure the full and harmonious implementation of both the information fusion requirement of the Homeland Security Act and the center that the President announced.

The recommendations include a list of significant reforms that the Intelligence Committees believe are essential for strengthening the FBI's domestic intelligence capability. In regard to these critically needed reforms, the Joint Inquiry has recommended that Congress should direct that the head of the Intelligence Community, together with the Attorney General and the Secretary of Homeland Security, should report to Congress on the FBI's progress. The report should include "the specific manner in which a new domestic intelligence service could be established in the United

The Honorable George J. Tenet January 29, 2003 Page 3

States, recognizing the need to enhance national security while fully protecting civil libertles."

The Committees expressed their strong conviction that "the Intelligence Community's employees remain its greatest resource." They recommend that the head of the Intelligence Community "should require that measures be implemented to greatly enhance the recruitment and development of a workforce with the intelligence skills and expertise needed for success in counterterrorist efforts." Several particular actions are set forth in the recommendation. One is that Intelligence Community agencies should expand and Improve counterterrorism training, including about information sharing among law enforcement and intelligence personnel, the use of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act, and watchlisting. The recommendation includes steps to improve intelligence Community language capabilities and the utilization of the skills and experience of retired personnel. It calls on the Intelligence Community to "enhance recruitment of a more ethnically and culturally diverse workforce."

A further personnel recommendation proposes, in part, that Congress enact legislation, modeled on the landmark Goldwater-Nichols Department of Defense Reorganization Act of 1986, to help instill the concept of "jointness" throughout the Intelligence Community and ensure that its components will work more closely together than has been the case. The mechanisms identified in the recommendation include such things as joint tours for intelligence and law enforcement personnel as well as incentives for joint service throughout the intelligence Community. In developing these ideas, Congress would benefit from the Administration's detailed proposals.

The Joint Inquiry identified several important objectives concerning classified information, including expanding access by federal agencies outside the Intelligence Community, by state and local authorities, and by the American public. To this end, we recommended that the Director of Central Intelligence, in consultation with the heads of key components of the Intelligence Community, including the Attorney General, should report to the Intelligence Committees on "proposals for a new and more realistic approach to the processes and structures that have governed the designation of sensitive and classified information." The report should also address "proposals to protect against the use of the classification process as a shield to protect agency self-interest."

The Congress and the Nation as a whole will be grateful for your attention and response to these and other matters identified in the course of the Joint Inquiry. Further, we are confident that the Congress will benefit from other recommendations

The Honorable George J. Tenet January 29, 2003 Page 4

that you might have for legislative or administrative action to improve the Nation's counterterrorist capabilities.

Sincerely,

Bob Graham

Chairman, Senate Intelligence Committee, 107th Congress

Porter Goss Chairman, House Intelligence

Committee, 107" and 108"

Congresses

Richard Shelby

Vice Chairman, Senate Intelligence Committee, 107th Congress

Nancy Pelosi

Ranking Minority Member, House Intelligence Committee, 107th Congress and Member ex officio (as Minority Leader), 108th Congress

Enclosure: As stated

S. REPT. No. 107-

107" CONGRESS, 20 SESSION

H. REPT. No. 107-

JOINT INQUIRY INTO INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY ACTIVITIES BEFORE AND AFTER THE TERRORIST ATTACKS OF SEPTEMBER 11, 2001

REPORT

OFTHE

U.S. SENATE SELECT COMMITTEE ON INTELLIGENCE

AND.

U.S. HOUSE PERMANENT SELECT COMMUTTEE ON INTELLIGENCE

TOGETHER WITH ADDITIONAL VIEWS

DECEMBER/2002

TOTAL PROPERTY

PART FOUR—FINDING, DISCUSSION AND NARRATIME REGARDING CERTAIN
SENSITIVE NATIONAL SECURITY MATTERS

20. Finding: While in the United States, some of the September 11 hijackers were in contact with, and received support or assistance from, individuals who may be connected to the Saudi Government. There is information, primarily from FBI sources, that at least two of those ladividuals were alleged by some to be Saudi intelligence officers. The Joint Inquiry's review confirmed that the Intelligence Community also has information, much of which has yet to be independently verified, indicating that individuals associated with the Saudi Government'in the United States may have other ties to al-Qu'ida and other terrorist groups. The FBI and CIA have informed the Joint Inquiry that, since the September 11 attacks, they are treating the Saudi issue seriously, but both still have only a limited understanding of the Saudi Government's fies to terrorist elements. In their testimony, wither CIA not FBI witnesses were able to identify definitively the extent of Saudi support for terrorist activity globally or within the United States and the extent to which such support, if it exists, is knowing or inodvertent in nature. The FBUs Washington Field Office evented asgund devoted to

E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)(d)

Only recently, and at least in part due to the Joint Inquiry's focus on this issue, did the FBI and CIA establish a working group to address the Saull issue. In the view of the Joint Inquiry, this gap in U.S. intelligence coverage is unacceptable, given the magnitude and immediacy of the potential risk to U.S. national security. The Intelligence Community needs to address this area of concern as aggressively and as quickly as possible.

Discussion: One reason for the limited understanding is that it was only after September 11 that the U.S. Government began to aggressively investigate this issue. Prior to September 11th, the FB rapparently did not focus investigative resources on Saudi nationals in the United States due to Saudi Arabia's status as on American "ally." A representative of the FBI

E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)

415

September 11, 2001, the FBI received 'no reporting from any member of the intelligence Conunctualy' that there was a presence in the United States.

According to various FBI documents and at least one-ClA memorandum, some of the September II hijackers, while in the United States, apparently had contracts with individuals who may be connected to the Saudi Government. While the Joint Industry uncovered this material during the course of its review of FBI and ClA documents, it did not attempt to investigate and assess the accuracy and significance of this information independently, recognizing that such a task would be beyond the scope of this long Inquiry. Instead, the Joint Inquiry referred a detailed compilation of information uncovered by the laquiry in documents and interviews to the FBI and ClA for further investigation by the Intelligence Community and, if appropriate, law enforcement agencies. A brief submarry of the available information regarding some of these individuals is illustrative for purposes of this report:

Investigation FOIA 5 USC §552(B)(7)(D)

Withheld from public release

under statutory authority of the Federal Bureau of

Omar al-Bayoumi. The FBI has received numerous reports from individuals in the Musium community, dating back to 1999, alleging that al-Bayoumi may be a Saudi intelligence officer. FBI files suggest that al-Bayoumi provided substantial assistance to Injuckers Khalid al-Mihdhar and Maiwaf al-Hazmi after they arrived in San Diego in February 2000. All Bayound met the hijackers at a public place shortly after his meeting with an individual at the Saudi consulate and there are indications in the files that his encounter with the hijschers may not have been accidental. During this same timeframe, al-Bayoumi had extensive contact with Saudi Government establishments in the United States and received financial support from a Saudi company affiliated with the Saudi Minisity of Defense. According to FBI files, at the company said that al-Bayouth received a monthly salary even though he had been there on only one occasion. This support increased substantially in April 2000, two months after the hijackers arrived in San Diego, decreased slightly in December 2000, and stayed at that same level until August 2001. That company reportedly had hes to Usame Bin Ladin and al-Oalida. Inaddition, the PBI determined that al-Bayoumi was in contact with several individuals under FBI investigation and with the Holy Land Foundation, which has been under investigation as a fundraising from for Harnes;

many -- on simple distributions

416 E

Osama Bassnan. Bassnan may have been in contact with al-Mindhar and al-Hazmi during their time in San Diego. Bassnan was a close associate of al-Bayoumi and Omar Bakarbashat, another one of the dijackers close associates. He also lived across the street from the hijackers, and made a comment to an EBI document, Bassnan told another tadividual that he met al-Hazmi through al-Bayoumi and litter that he met al-Hazmi through al-Bayoumi and litter that he met two of the hijackers through al-Bayoumi. He also told the asset that al-Bayoumi was accessed because he know al-Heami and al-Mindhar very wall. The document gives on to state that Bassnan and al-Bayoumi have been "close to each other for a long time." Bassnan has many ties to the Saudi Government, including past employment by the Saudi Arabian Education Mission, referred to in EBI documents as

The EBI also received reports from including to a CIA mento, Bassnan reportedly received funding and possibly a

E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)

E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)

The report states that during that trip a member of the Saudi-Royal Family provided Bussian with a significant amount of cosh. FBI information indicates that Bussian is an extremust and supporter of Usama Bin Ludio, and has necessarized to the Eritroun Islamic Jihad and the Blind Shaykh;

fake passport from Smidt Government officials. He and his wife have received financial support from the Saudi Ambassador to the United States and his wife. A ClA report also indicates that Bassinan traveled to Houston in 2002 and met with an individual who was

• Shaykhal-Thumairy. According to FBI documents and a CIA memorandum, al-linari and al-Mihdhar may have been in contact with Shaykh al-Thumairy, an accredited diplomat at the Saudi Consulate in Los Angeles and one of the "imams" at the King. Fahad mosque in Culver City. California. Also according to EBI documents, the mosque was built in 1998 from funding provided by Soudi Anibia's Crown Prince Abdulazia. The mosque is reportedly attended by members of the Saudi Consulate in Los Angeles and is widely recognized for its anti-Western views.

417

- CARDING ZEROVEN
- Salehal-Hussayen. In September 2001, Saleh el-Hussayen, reportedly a Saudi Interior Ministry official, stayed at the same hotel in Herndon, Virginia where al-Hazmi was staying. While al-Hussayen claimed after September 11 not to know the hijackers, FB1 agents believed he was being deceptive. He was able to depart the United States despite FB1 offorts to lucate and re-interview him; and
- Abdullah Bin Ladin, Abdullah Bin Ladin claims to work for the Saudi Embassy in
 Washington, D.C. as an administrative officer. He is identified by the FB1 as Usaria Bin
 Ladin's half brother. He is a close friend of Mohammed Quadir-Harmani, a possible
 associate of Mohammed Atta and Matwan at Shehhi prior to September 11, 2001.

The Joint Inquiry also found other indications that individuals connected to the Saudi Government have they to terrorist networks, including:

- The CIA and FBI have identified the for Tamiyah Mosque in Culver City as a site of extremist-related activity. Several subjects of FBI investigations prior to September 10 had close connections to the mosque and are holieved to have laundered money through this mosque to non-profit organizations oversens affiliated with Usama Bin Ludin. To an interview, an FBI agent said he believed that Saudi Government money was being laundered inrough the mosque;
- Another Saudi national with close ties to the Saudi Royal Family, as the subject of FBI counterterrorism investigations and reportedly was checking security at the United States' southwest border in 1999 and discussing the possibility of infiltrating' individuals into the United States.
- According to FBI documents, several of the phone numbers found in the phone book of
 Abu Zubeida, a senior al-Qa'ida operative captured in Painstan in Marcii 2002, could be
 linked, at least indirectly, to telephone numbers in the United States. One of those U.S.
 manbers is subscribed to by the ASPCOE Corporation, which is located in Aspen.

E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)(d)

Colorado, and manages the affairs of the Colorado residence of the Sandi Ambassador Bandar. The FBI noted that ASPCOL has an unlisted telephone number. A November 13, 2002 FB1 response to the Joint Inquiry states that "CIA traces have revealed no direct links between numbers found in Zunnich's phone hook and numbers in the United States."

- According to an FBI document, the telephone number of a bodyguard at the Saudi Embassy in Washington, DC, who some have alleged maybe a securious; and
- According to an FBI agent in Phoenix, the FBI suspects Mohammed 21-Qudhacein of heling Al-Qudhacein was involved in a 1999 incident aboard an America West flight, which the FBI's Phoenix riffice now suspects may have been a "dry run" to test airline security. During the flight, al-Qudhacein and his associate asked the flight attendants a variety of suspicious questions; al-Qudhacein then attempted to enter the cockpit on two persoins. Al-Qudhacein and his associate were flying to Washington, D.C. to attend a party at the Saudi Embassy, and both claimed that their tickers were paid for by the Saudi Embassy. During the course of its investigations, the FBI has discovered that both al-Qudhacein and the other individual javolved in this incident had connections to terrorism.

Finally, the Committees are particularly concerned about the serious parare of all against contained in a CIA memorandum found by the Joint inquiry Staffin the files of the HBE's San

Diego Field Office. That memorandum, which discusses alleged financial connections between the September IT hijackers, Saudi Government officials, and members of the Saudi Royal family, was drafted by a CIA officer.

E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)(d) information from FBI files. The CIA officer sent if to the CTC to determine whether CIA had additional information. He also provided a copy to the FBI agent responsible for the individual circumstantians of the CIA memorandum, the FBI agent included the memorandum in an individual case file and did not forward to FBI Headquarters. FBI Headquarters, therefore, was unwatter.

anasa isana

479

E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)	Astronomia promo-

of statements in the memorandum until the Joint Inquiry brought the memorandum's implications to the Bureau's attention. Se

E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)(d)

Possible Saudi Government Connections to Terrorists and Terrorist Groups

While in the United States, some of the September 11 injackers were in contact with, and received support or assistance from individuals who may be connected to the Saudi Government. There is information, from FBI sources, that at feast two of those individuals were alleged to be Saudi intelligence officers. The Joint Inquiry's review confirmed that the Intelligence Community also has information, much of which remains speculative and yet to be independently verified, indicating that Saudi Government officials in the United States may have other ries to al-Qa'ida and other terrorist groups.

The Committees are particularly concerned about the scrious nature of allegations contained in a CIA memorandum found within the files of the FBI's San Diego Field Office.

That memorandum, which discusses alleged financial connections between the September 11 hijackers, Saudi Government officials, and members of the Saudi Royal Family, was drafted by a CIA officer.

Lielying primarily on information; from FBI files.

E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)

In their restimony before the Joint Inquiry, neither the CIA nor the FRE was able to definitively identify for these Committees the extent of Saudi support for terrorist activity globally or within the United States and the extent to which such support, if it exists, is intentional production in harve. Both the FBL and CIA have indicated to the Committees that they are now aggressively pursuing Saudi-related terrorism issues.

Prior to September 11th, the FBI apparently did not focus investigative	i i
Soudi nation the United States due to Saudi Azabiz's status as an American "ally".	ls in
APPER	E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)(d)
A representative of the FBI's the state of	osed.
	E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)

75. 1.8 ..

FUI SECRET

hearings that, prior to September 11^{et}, the FRI received the reporting from any member of the Intelligence Community distathere is a presence in the United States. E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)(d)

It should be clear that this Joint Inquiry has made no final determinations as to the registrict or sufficiency of the information registring these issues that we found contained in FBI and CIA documents. It was not the task of this foint Inquiry to conductific kind of extensive investigation that would be required to determined the true significance of any such alleged connections to the Saudi Government. On the mechand, it is possible that these kinds of connections could suggest as indicated in a part of the first support for these terrorists within the Saudi Co. 13526, section 1.4(c) "incontrovertible evidence that there is support for these terrorists within the Saudi Government." On the other hand, it is also possible that further investigation of these allegations could reveal tegitimate, and innocent, explanations for these associations.

Given the serious national security implications of this information, however, the leadership of the Joint Inquiry is referring the staff's compilation of televarit information to both the FBI and the CIA for investigative review and appropriate investigative and intelligence action.

Possible Connections Between the September 11 Hijnekers and Saudi Covernment Officials in the United States

In reviewing TBI documents and the CIA memorandum, the found Inquiry Staff has examined information suggesting that:

One individual who provided assistance to Nawai at Harmi and Khalid at Mindhar may be connected to the Saudi Government. A second individual who may have been in contact with al-Hazmi and Al-Mindhar also has his torthe Saudi Government, including connections to the Saudi Ambassador to the United States. There is reporting in FB1 files that persons have alleged that both of these individuals may be Saudi intelligence officers;

431 .

E.O. 13526, section 1.4(c)

• The September II bijackers may have been in contact with other Saudi Government

officials in the United States prior to the September IT attacks and

 Sandi Governmentiofficials in the United States may have fits to Usamo Bin Ladin's terrorist network.

Omarul-Bayoumi and Osama Bassnan

Two individuals known to the FBI prior to September 11, 2001 - Omar al-Bayount and Osama Plassnan - may have provided assistance or support to al-Hazini and al-Middles while the two hijschers-to-be were living in San Diego. While the documentary evidence that al-Bayoumi provided assistance to al-Plazini and al-Middhar is solid, the files contain only limited evidence that Osama Bassnan had confacts with the two individuals.

When al-Hazini and al-Mindiar moved to San Diego, at Bayouni provided them with considerable assistance. Defore the hijackers moved in with the long-time EBI informant, they stayed at al-Bayoumi's apartment for several days juith al-Bayoumi was able to find them an apartment. Al-Bayoumi then co-signed their lease and may have paid their first month's rent and security deposit. After al-Hazini and al-Mindhar moved into their own apartment, al-Bayoumi threw a party to welcome them to the San Diego community. He also tasked Modhar Abdullah, another individual from the Islamic Center of San Diego (ICSD), to help them get acclimated to the United States. Abdullah served as their translator, helped them get drivers. Receases, and assisted them in locating flight schools:

The PBL notes, in its November 18, 1002 response that "financial records indicate a cash deposit of the same unount as the cashier's check into al-Bayound's bank account to the name day, which suggests that the hijacker teimbursed him?" FBL November 18 Response, 2. However, another FDI document, dated Gelober 18, 2002, appears to reach a rightly different conclusion. This document states that "a review of Kitalid Al-Midhae and Nawo Al-Hazral's bank records indicate there is no bank document attention that supports the veimbursence of fifteent money, or any monitor to Otrar Al-Bayourni som al-Hazral or Al-Midhae.